

Maritime Risk International

i-law.com

P&I, claims management and loss prevention

Volume 26 Issue 7

September 2012

Ship litigation

Careful wordings crucial



- Crisis management essential
- Top four risk spots analysed
- Mediation and costs examined

**“Your
Full Service
Retail Specialist
in P&I and
Marine
Insurance”**

RaetsMarine.com

ROTTERDAM • PARIS • LONDON • SINGAPORE

Editor: Liz Booth
liz@lizbooth.co.uk

Editorial enquiries: Ian Law
Tel: 020 7017 4045
Fax: 020 7017 5274
ian.law2@informa.com

Designer: Lorraine Brown

Managing Director: Steve Hotham
Printed by: Halstan Printing Group, Bucks.

www.i-law.com

Cover image: Gertjan Hooijer / Shutterstock.com

informa

law & finance

ISSN 1742-9404 © Informa UK Ltd, Published 10 times a year by Informa Law & Finance, 1-2 Bolt Court, Fleet Street, London EC4A 3DQ, UK Tel: +44 (0)20 7017 5532, Fax: +44 (0)20 7017 4781 © Informa UK Ltd 2012

Copyright: While we want you to make the best use of *Maritime Risk International* we also need to protect our copyright. We would remind you that copying is illegal. However, please contact us directly should you have any special requirements.

Informa Law & Finance is an Informa business, one of the world's leading providers of specialist information and services for the academic, scientific, professional and commercial business communities.

Registered Office: Mortimer House, 37-41 Mortimer Street, London W1T 3JH. Registered in England and Wales No 1072954.

Lloyd's and the Lloyd's Crest are the registered trademarks of the Society incorporated by the Lloyd's Act 1871 by the name of Lloyd's.

In this issue

REGULARS

- 4 **News**
- 7 **Our Mutual Friends**
- 24 **Classified directory of services**

FEATURES

- 8 **Security briefing: Top marine risks** 16 **Check the meaning**
Topping the danger list: John Sanjay Patel, of 4 Pump Court, reanalyses the distinction between guarantees and demand bonds
- 9 **The importance of evidence** 18 **Mind the trap**
Ian Teare, of Norton Rose, warns collecting evidence should be critical in any crisis management
Alex Davis, of Stephenson Harwood, looks at increased value policies
- 12 **The Italian perspective** 20 **Travel bans in new light**
Claudio Perrella, of LexJus Sinacta, looks at subrogation in marine insurance, providing an Italian view
James Mackay and Alex Kemp, of Holman Fenwick Willan LLP, look at the refusal of voyage orders due to war risks
- 14 **Costs management approaching** 22 **Too much of a good thing?**
With costs management to be introduced in all courts from April 2013, Thomas Blackburn, of Just Costs Solicitors, considers the implications
Jonathan Lux, of Jams International rebuts the suggestion there is too much mediation of shipping disputes

EDITORIAL BOARD

- Charles B Anderson** – Senior Vice President, Skuld North America Inc
- Dr Phil Anderson** – Managing Director, ConsultISM Ltd
- Ruben T Del Rosario** – Managing Partner, Del Rosario & Del Rosario, Philippines
- Nazery Khalid** – Senior Fellow, Center for Maritime Economics and Industries, Maritime Institute of Malaysia
- LeRoy Lambert** – Partner, Blank Rome LLP, New York
- Derek Luxford** – Partner, Hicksons, Sydney
- Dr Colin Y C Ong** – Managing Partner, Dr Colin Ong Legal Services, Brunei, Barrister & Arbitrator, Essex Court Chambers, London
- Dr Z Oya Özçayir** – Maritime Law consultant and Author, Izmir Law Bar, Turkey, Member of the IMO Rosters of Experts



Yes, I would like to subscribe to *Maritime Risk International*, £1578 (£1315 + VAT) / €1645 / \$2370

Name Email

Company Job title

Address

Tel Fax

I enclose my cheque for £1578 / €1645 / \$2370 payable to Informa UK Ltd Please invoice me

To pay by credit card, please order online or call +44 (0)20 7017 5540

ONLINE: www.informaprofessional.com/mri

POST: Informa Law, Subscription Department, Sheepen Place, Colchester, Essex, CO3 3LP, UK

PHONE: +44 (0) 20 7017 5540

FAX: +44 (0) 20 7017 4614

EMAIL: subscriptions@informa.com

Data Protection Personal Data supplied is subject to the Data Protection Act 1998. The personal information shown on this form, and/or provided by you, will be held on a database and may be shared with companies in the Informa Group in the UK and internationally. It may be used to keep you, or any additional names provided by you, up to date with developments in your industry. If you do not wish your details to be available to companies in the Informa Group, please write to the Database Manager, PO Box 461, West Byfleet, Surrey, KT14 9BN, United Kingdom, Tel: +44 (0)20 7017 5239, fax: +44 (0) 20 7017 6241 or ibiupdates@informa.com. Occasionally your details may be obtained from, or made available to, carefully selected external companies for marketing purposes. If you do not wish to receive details about their products and services, please tick the box

Please provide your VAT number:

The Italian **perspective**

Claudio Perrella, of LexJus Sinacta, looks at subrogation in marine insurance, providing an Italian view



Shutterstock.com

Where insurers indemnify their insured they are entitled under Italian law to pursue a subrogated action against the third party liable for the damage/loss (article 1916 civil code).

The insurer becomes entitled to take over the interest of the assured and is subrogated to all the rights and remedies of the assured as from the time of the event causing the loss, but is not entitled to exercise rights which are not available to the insured.

“Many disputes have arisen in the last 20 years in cases where the transmission of rights appeared to be flawed”

Defences against the insured are also valid against the insurer and defendants to such actions have increasingly contested insurers' title to sue on the grounds that the insurers may not properly be subrogated in their insured's rights.

Under Italian law there are in fact two principal systems of subrogation:

- a) by agreement and/or assignment of rights; such agreement can be simultaneous with payment (pursuant to article 1201 c.c.) or may follow the payment by means of assignment of rights (pursuant to article 1260 c.c.).
- b) is by operation of law, pursuant to article 1916 civil code: where the indemnity is paid pursuant to a valid contractual obligation, the insured's rights will automatically be transferred to the insurer.

Validity of the subrogation

Many disputes have arisen in the last 20 years in cases where the transmission of rights appeared to be flawed, either because the subrogation agreement was not concluded at the same time as the indemnity was paid, or because insurers were not bound to pay the indemnity under the policy, and third parties who would otherwise have been liable to the insured have been able to challenge the subrogated insurers' action (Cassazione n. 7300/1991, *SIAT c. Adriatica di Navigazione*; Cassazione n. 6455/1994, *Levante Assicurazioni c. Fumagalli*; Cassazione n. 919/1999, *The Tokio Marine & Fire Insurance co. Ltd. c. Japan Air Line*).

It is settled case law that the defendant is entitled to ask for

the disclosure of the insurance policy in order to check whether the indemnity has been paid in favour of the party having insurable interest and in case it transpires that the indemnity was wrongly paid (ie in favour of a party not exposed to the risks of transit) the subrogated insurer may fail to succeed in pursuing the recovery action.

Insurers are therefore required to check accurately whether they are going to indemnify a party entitled to receive the indemnity. As a general rule, under Italian law title in goods automatically passes from the seller to the buyer at the conclusion of the contract of sale of specified goods; in case of sale of unspecified goods title in goods passes to the buyer once the goods are identified; when goods must be carried from one place to another identification usually takes place by delivery to the carrier or to the forwarding agent.

“Insurers are therefore required to check accurately whether they are going to indemnify a party entitled to receive the indemnity”

An exception to the rule is the carriage of parcels of goods in bulk commingled: in this case the specification takes place at the time of the actual delivery to the receiver (Cassazione n. 8861/1996, *Fall. Agenzie generali caffè c. Soc. Messican Caffè*; Court of Appeal Genoa 4 July 2008 *Ortofrutticola Acese Srl c. UMS Generali Marine e Siat*).

The shipper/seller is entitled to receive the insurance indemnity in case it has retained ownership over the goods, or the transport has been performed at shippers’ risk by virtue of an agreement derogating the general principle as to transfer of risk set out by article 1510 c.c., pursuant to which risks (and – for unspecified goods in bulk – ownership) are transferred upon delivery to the carrier.

The agreement must be clear and unequivocal: ambiguous clauses (especially those referring to allocation of transport costs) are generally considered ineffective to defer transfer of risks and ownership.

When does subrogation takes place?

A distinctive feature of Italian law is related to the moment when subrogation takes place.

Pursuant to settled case-law (Cassazione n. 9469/2004, *SIAT Assicurazioni c. Gestione Industrie Confezioni*), the subrogation takes place once the insurer has paid the indemnity and has expressed the intention to exercise the right to act as subrogated party: although a few decisions have admitted the possibility that the intention to replace the insured in the exercise of the rights versus the third party may be expressed for the first time in the writ of summons, it is wise to send a formal notice of subrogation claiming damages before serving the writ.

Such a notice is irreversible: once sent the insured loses its title to claim; conversely, before the notice the insured retains title to claim even if it has received the payment of the indemnity.

In light of the above, in case the subrogated action may expose the insurer to exceptions and technicalities, it is



Shutterstock.com

common practice in Italy to agree with the insured that the action is brought in the name of the insured but on behalf of the insurer (who will therefore bear the legal costs of the action).

Who is entitled to sue the carrier?

Under Italian law (article 1689 civil code) liabilities under the contract of carriage are transferred to the consignee when this latter demands or takes delivery of the goods or makes a claim under the contract of carriage.

Insurers should therefore always insist on receiving an assignment of the rights arising from the contract of carriage signed by the receiver every time they indemnify the shipper/seller (or a party which does not coincide with the receiver appearing in the contract of carriage and/or the transport documents) and goods have reached destination.

An additional caution is finally recommended in consideration of the fact that under Italian law, time-bar can be avoided by sending a request for payment or a letter claiming damages (or a writ, in case the claim is subject to a stricter time limitation defined by Italian law as “decadenza”) only by the party entitled to claim.

Hence, a request sent to the carrier by the shipper when goods have reached destination and have been delivered to the receiver may be ineffective.

Insurers must make sure therefore that the assignment of rights is obtained in due course, well before the expiry of the time-bar and that the existence of an assignment prior to the service of the claim or the transmission of the claim letter is proven beyond doubt. **MRI**



Claudio Perrella

Claudio Perrella is a partner at LS LexJus Sinacta